C A N A D A
PROVINCE OF QUEBEC
DISTRICT OF MONTREAL
N°: 500-17-038173-079

SUPERIOR COURT FÉDÉRATION CANADIENNE DES ÉTUDIANTES ET DES ÉTUDIANTES ÉLÉMENT DU QUÉBEC

Plaintiff

-vs-

NINA AMROV
-and
MAHDI ALTALIBI

Defendants

-and-

MALAMO SAVVAS-BEAUMONT SOSHIMA VERA-CADET MELANEE THOMAS, ET AL

Mises en cause

EXAMINATION ON AFFIDAVIT OF GEORGE SOULE

APPEARANCES:

Me ROSELINE OUELLETTE

for Plaintiff and Mises en cause (S. Vera-Cadet, M. Thomas, R. Nassim, E. Jabouin)

Me WILLIAM DE MERCHANT

Me PIERRE-LOUIS FORTIN-LEGRIS

for Defendants (N. Amrov, M. Altalibi) and Mise en cause (M. Silverman)

Me STÉPHANE ROY

for Mises en cause (Concordia Student Union and Dawson Student Union)

AUGUST 31, 2007

AA070831.A1

ANITA AUZA, o.c.R.

STÉNO EXACT

LIST OF UNDERTAKINGS

	<u>PAGE</u>
U-1 :	Provide copy of Roland's e-mail 55
U-2 :	Provide invoice from locksmith 90
.U-3 :	Provide authorization to obtain recording of telephone call from 9-1-1 (under reserve)

LIST OF OBJECTIONS

			<u>PAGE</u>
#1.	Who did you meet with Dawson?		12
#2.	So, who did you meet with the S.U.?		15
#3.	Who did you meet with the S.S.M.U.?		15
#4.	Tell me where you're working from? (under reserve)		18
#5.	Okay, you don't dispute that she was elected as the V.P.?		27
#6.	Okay, what did Nina ask on the other side?	• •	48
#7.	And when you learned of that position, or that interpretation of the bylaw, what was your were you en d'accord avec ça?		58
#8.	Before the meeting of the twenty-fourth (24th) of July, did you speak with anybody at C.S.U. to try to obtain such a resolution?		63
#9.	And did he permit you to go in? Did he object to your presence?		72
#10.	So, you did not want to give your key to somebody that you did not know?		73
#11.	Okay, now, did you talk to anybody, telling them that you would be ready to work for the Federation if you would be rehired?		. 87
#12.	Did anybody contact you concerning your rehirement?		. 88
<u> </u>	-4- STÉN	<u> </u>	XACT

LIST OF OBJECTIONS (Contd.)

		PAGE
#13.	Did anybody ask you if you were ready to work for the Federation?	. 88
#14.	Did he tell you why he was concerned that he would not be paid?	. 90
#15.	Where were you?	. 107
#16.	Objection to Undertaking #3 (under reserve)	. 112
#17.	Now, why did Erica Jabouin call Roland Nassim? (under reserve)	. 112

In the year of Our Lord, two thousand and seven (2007), on this thirty-first (31st) day of August,

PERSONALLY CAME AND APPEARED:

GEORGE SOULE, born the tenth (10th) day of September, nineteen hundred and eighty (1980); Student and employee of the Canadian Federation of Students, Quebec Component; residing at two zero eight seven (2087) de Maisonneuve Boulevard West, apartment six (6), Montreal, Province of Quebec;

WHO, after having made a Solemn Affirmation, doth depose and say as follows:

Me WILLIAM DE MERCHANT,

On behalf of Defendants (N. Amrov, M. Altalibi) and Mise en cause (M. Silverman):

Okay, just starting -- William de Merchant. The case 500-17-038173-079, do you have the other number? I don't have...

(DISCUSSION OFF RECORD)

1

1

1

1

Me WILLIAM DE MERCHANT:

And also the case 500-17-038176-072 -- are going to be heard together this morning, and there's some Affidavits from both cases that are going to be interrogated on this morning. Is that okay?

Me STÉPHANE ROY:

Okay.

EXAMINATION BY Me WILLIAM DE MERCHANT,

On behalf of Defendants (N. Amrov, M. Altalibi) and Mise en cause (M. Silverman):

- Q- Okay, Mr. Soule, you have the Affidavit in front of you, I guess?
- A- Again, I'm sorry, it's "Soule."
- Q- Soule?

1

2

3

- A- Soule, yes.
- Q- Yes, you have the Affidavit in front of you?
- A- : I do.
- Q- Okay.

You present yourself as an employee of the Canadian Federation of Students, so I understand that you're testifying this morning as an employee of the Federation?

A- M'hm.

STÉNO EXACT

1(

1:

1:

1:

1

2

2.

1:

STÉNO EXACT

5	. Q -	Okay, so what is your status with the Federation
		at this time?
	A-	I am the Office Manager.
6	Q-	Office Manager.
,		Since when are you an Office Manager of the
		Canadian Federation of Students?
	A -	August third (3rd)
7	Q-	August third (3rd)?
	A-	two thousand and seven (2007).
8	Q-	Okay, what were you doing before that date?
	A-	I was the organizer for the Canadian
		Federation of Students of Quebec organizer.
9	Q-	Okay, since when?
	A-	August seventh (7th), two thousand and six
		(2006).
10	Q-	Till when?
	A-	Well, I think there's some lack of clarity on
		that.
13	Q-	I'm asking you till when?
	A-	Okay. Well, as far as I understand, until I
		thought it was changed on August third (3rd).
12	Q-	Okay, there was no interruption in your
		employment?
	A-	As far as my understanding of
13	Q-	Okay.

4.4

Okay, what was your job as an organizer?

- A- Well, it was pretty comprehensive. It starting from -- anything from helping with office maintenance, which actually included keeping the office clean, to also helping with the political dealings of the organization. So, staying in contact with the member locals, helping with campaign implementation, helping with service implementation.
- Q- "Protocol"? What did you say, "Protocol helping..." -- what did you say?
- A- I didn't say "protocol," so I'm sorry.
- Q- No? What -- okay, I did understand -- you are cleaning the office, as I understand...
- A- Sorry, it was everything from maintaining the office, so basic stuff like cleaning, taking out the garbage...
- O- Yes.

14

15

14

A- ... exciting things like that, to maintaining contact with member local associations, to service implementation, to campaign implementation, to assist with the development of campaigns, and to help as an assistant basically in all ways, both political and administrative, to the Provincial Executive, as

1

1

1:

1:

1

1.

1

1

1

2

2

2

2

3

ڍ

- -- and it's more specifically to members at large.
- Q- Okay.

17

18

As an organizer, you helped with the campaign, is that what -- what campaign are you talking about?

- A- All campaigns of the Federation.
- Q- Give me an example of what is a campaign.
- A- Well, we had several campaigns, for instance, that were approved for the 'o six, 'o seven ('06 '07) year, that included everything from fighting for the tuition fee freeze, to fighting for access for full-time students over the age of twenty-five (25) for the STM bus pass.

We included -- this year we added on to the campaigns as Blood Services -- there's a variety of campaigns that were approved through the Campaigns Guide last year.

We also help with other campaigns such as membership drives and the build-up for those such things. Any campaigns of the Federation, and, frankly, also as part of maintaining contact and assisting member locals with some of their internal campaigns, as well.

Q- Okay. You're saying that you help for the

19

٠٠٠٠ .

(5)

1

1.

1

1

1

1

1

1

1

2

2

2

membership drive. What is that?

A- Well, we haven't had one this year, but there was build-up for -- there was an expectation of two (2) actually coming for the 'o seven, 'o eight ('07 - '08) year.

Membership drives are after perspective membership, which is taken out by some member locals, such as the Dawson Student Union and the McGill Students -- the Students Society of McGill University here in Montreal.

Following the perspective membership there's ultimately a referendum, and part of that, in building up for that process is also referred to often as a membership drive, and membership is an element as far as building up to inform the members of what the Federation is, so that the individual members are ready to vote when a referendum does come around.

- Q- So, you're saying -- as I understand -- maybe
 I'm wrong -- you help by going and getting the
 prospective members, that was part of your job?
- A- Well, I'm not sure what the phrasing of -- as far as "going to get"...
- Q- Yes.

2 d

21

3.

A- ... but as far as we're...

1

1

1.

1

1

1

1

2

2

2

2

- 22 Q- Recruiting, you said?
 - A- Well, I think recruiting is even a fairly -- not necessarily the exact word, because it's not necessarily...
 - Q- But that's the one you used here, that's why.
 - A- No, I'm not sure that I did.

I think that the -- it all depends on what the Provincial Executive decides on, and what the goals are, and what numbers are seeking membership, helping with those processes as decided upon by the Provincial Executive.

- Q- Okay, did you ever meet the prospective members to tell them what was involved as their rights and their obligations towards the Federation, if they did join?
- A- Yes.

23

24

25

Q- You did. Okay.

Who did you meet with Dawson?

A- Well...

Me ROSELINE OUELLETTE:

O Objection. I will object to that, it's not in the Affidavit.

Me WILLIAM DE MERCHANT:

A credibility issue.

1

1

1:

1

1

1

2

2

Yes, I know, but you have to ask questions about the facts that he's stating in the Affidavit, it's not...

Me WILLIAM DE MERCHANT:

Or the -- or inside of the -- la requête.

Me ROSELINE OUELLETTE:

No, it's on the Affidavit.

Me STÉPHANE ROY:

No, it's on Affidavit today.

Me WILLIAM DE MERCHANT:

Yes, but the -- l'injonction, si vous regardez la jurisprudence, permet les questions sur la requête aussi. On va le prendre sous réserve, de toute... on va aller devant un juge un jour, de tout façon, là.

Me ROSELINE OUELLETTE:

Mais, moi -- I can say that if you go on the Motion, we have one (1) representative, it's going to be only George. But we accept to do on all the Affiants, the persons that signed the Affidavit, so we will go on the Affidavit. That is the way...

Me STÉPHANE ROY:

Please verify right now, or -- what we're doing

10

1:

1:

1:

1.

1:

1

1

1

1

<u>;</u>

2

2

today.

Me WILLIAM DE MERCHANT:

Yes...

Me STÉPHANE ROY:

Or if you go on the Motion ...

Me WILLIAM DE MERCHANT:

Yes.

Me STÉPHANE ROY:

... on all the facts in the Motion, with all the others, me, I won't even go under reserve today. I'm talking about mine, we're not there yet. It may be different with...

Me ROSELINE OUELLETTE:

No, it's the same -- we have the same...

Me STÉPHANE ROY:

Because the Motion...

Me WILLIAM DE MERCHANT:

Oh, no, but I don't mind if you don't want to go into reserve, those questions will be asked, there will be an objection, and we'll go in front of a Judge to have it...

Me STÉPHANE ROY:

ļ.

No, but we can decide today -- let's go off record two (2) seconds.

1

Okay.

(DISCUSSION OFF RECORD)

Me WILLIAM DE MERCHANT:

Q- So, who did you meet with the S.U.?

Me ROSELINE OUELLETTE:

O Objection.

2 d

27

28

Me WILLIAM DE MERCHANT:

Okay.

Q- Who did you meet with the S.S.M.U.?

Me ROSELINE OUELLETTE:

O Objection.

Me WILLIAM DE MERCHANT:

Okay.

- Q- Okay, what are your new functions as Office Manager? What has changed following the changing -- you said that before the third (3rd) of August, you were an Officer Manager -- no, an organizer, and now you're an Office Manager, what has changed in your job description?
- A- Well, since that time a new Staff Relations

 Officer has not yet been appointed, nor have I
 the Provincial Executive been allowed to meet

1

1

2

2

2

2

and move forward, so as a result the general -my understanding of how things are moving
forward has not changed, although I was informed
by several people who were in attendance at the
August third (3rd) meeting that the intention
and some discussion that happened was that there
would be some changes, but that would be
discussed with me...

- 29 Q- Yes.
 - A- ... moving forward with my contract.
- Q- Okay. My question, what are the changes in your job description at this point?
 - A- At this point, none.
- 31 Q- None. No change, okay.
 - A- To my understanding.
- 32 Q- Are you getting paid right now?
 - A- Am I -- do I expect to be paid, or am I receiving cheques?
- 33 Q- Are you receiving pay?
 - A- No.

34 Q- No. Okay.

Who is your -- who do you report to, to this point -- at this point?

- A- Well, I report...
- 35 Q- What is the change of the hierarchy as -- with

1

1

1.

1.

1

1

1

1

2

2

2

2

your employer?

3 d

37

38

- A- I discuss things with the members at large who contact me, and have decided to move forward with the organization, or the ones who have contacted me since the meeting on August third (3rd), and I continue to discuss with them.
- Q- I don't -- I don't ask who you speak to, I say who do you report to as your employer? Who gives you orders, who gives you mandates?
- A- Well, the members at large who were elected on August third (3rd), as well as other members of the Provincial Executive Committee, and I also kind of try to deal with the executive committees from those members that are moving forward with the organization, or attempting to.
- Q- Okay, you're telling me that -- how many bosses do you have right now -- do you report to?
- A- I can't say an exact number, because the Provincial Executive hasn't had a chance to meet to appoint all their members.
- Q- Name me the person that you're referring to, that you -- that can contact you and give you mandates. Name them.
- A- Well, primarily I deal with Soshima Vera-Cadet and Melanee Thomas.

1

1

1:

1:

1

1

L

1

1

1

2

2

2.

- Q- Okay. That was not too hard to say. Okay.
 Where is your working office?
 - A- I do not have access to my working office.
- 4d Q- Where are you working from?
 - A- From a variety of locations.
 - Q- Tell me where you're working from.
 - A- A variety of locations.

41

÷ ;

O Maître de Merchant, I will object to this kind of question, it's not relevant.

Me WILLIAM DE MERCHANT:

Oh, it is -- it is so much. He's saying that he's an employee of the Federation, I'm allowed to know from where he's working.

Me ROSELINE OUELLETTE:

Yes, but now we're not in the case that -- it's not a thing that is said in an Affidavit. It's not...

Me WILLIAM DE MERCHANT:

So, you're objecting to...

Me ROSELINE OUELLETTE:

Yes.

Me WILLIAM DE MERCHANT:

Okay.

- Q- You want to clarify?
- A- Yes.

42

43

- Q- Okay, I will let him clarify, but under reserve.

 I will say under reserve of an objection.
- A- The office of the Federation, as is public and definitely part of this case, has been locked out, and we do not have access to it, so I work...

Me WILLIAM DE MERCHANT:

- Q- I'm asking you where you're working from.
- A- ... I work from home, I work...

Me ROSELINE OUELLETTE:

He's...

Me WILLIAM DE MERCHANT:

I'm not asking him if other locals -- or he doesn't have access, I'm asking him where he's working.

A- So, what I'm telling you is that I would like to be working in my office. Barring that, I work from various locations, such as my house, such as friends' places with Internet, and other places where I can access Internet, and move forward, and work, and use a telephone, and sit down at a desk, or in some level of privacy.

1

1

1

1

2

It's -- to list the names would be as ludicrous as talking about who I met with at each member locals, because those list in the hundreds, so...

Q- Okay. Now, if we take paragraph 8 of your Affidavit, okay, if we look at the last phrase of this:

45

46

"... the student members of a full member student organization, through their said student organization, pay membership dues to the CFS-Q, whereas there is no requirement that prospective members, local oganizations pay membership dues."

Now, isn't it true that there's some membership dues that are paid by prospective members to the National, and the National re-gives money to the CFS-Q?

- A- There are no fees paid to the Canadian Federation of Students, Quebec.
- Q- I'm asking you isn't it true that some fees are paid to the National, and the National gives back some money to the CFS-Q?

1

1

- A- There is a prospective membership fee that is paid to the Canadian Federation of Students, and the Canadian Federation of Students Services.
- 7 Q- Yes.
 - A- And then separate from that there is -- in addition to the name-sharing agreement that the Canadian Federation of Students, Quebec component has with the Canadian -- the name-sharing agreement that is between the Canadian Federation of Students, Quebec component, and the Canadian Federation of Students and the Canadian Federation of Students Services, there is a transfer of funds that exist to provincial components...
- 48 Q- Okay.
 - A- ... and that is made up of one (1) -- there's a bylaw that describes that...
 - O- Yes.

49

5 d

- A- ... and that fee is not necessarily prescribed as a fixed number.
- Q- That's good. That's your opinion, and we'll look at the bylaws. Okay.

Now, at paragraph 11, okay, you say that:
"The fundamental decision-making
body at CFS-Q, as provided in

1

1

1

1

1

1

1

2

2

2

this bylaw, is the plenary."

What do you mean by "fundamental decision-making body"?

- A- Well, in all my operating within the Canadian Federation of Students, the Canadian Federation of Students, Ontario, and specifically the Canadian Federation of Students, Quebec component, is that the driving -- the main decision-making body is the General Meeting, they're the ones who make the decisions, who direct the Provincial Executive Committee, who then carry out the work.
- Q- Do -- but, it's the main -- but are -- no, that's okay, that -- by "fundamental" you're saying it is the main -- that's what your...
- A- The highest decision-making body.
- Q- Highest. But "highest," does it mean it's the only...
 - A- Pardon me?

51

53

54

- Q- It's not the only decision-making body?
- A- It makes the ultimate decisions that then are -- and those decisions are then interpreted and carried out by other bodies -- by the Provincial Executive.
- Q- Okay. Now, in paragraph 15 you say:

STÉNO EXACT

1

1

1

1

1

1

1

1

1

2

2

2

-22-

"At all times relevant to the present proceeding..."

What do you mean by "At all times relevant"? What is the timeframe that you're talking about?

- A- Well, at all times -- so, I mean, in this case it's since -- I guess near the end of May, so following the National General Meeting...
- 55 Q- Okay.

56

57

58

- A- ... to today.
- Q- Okay. So, the timeframe that you're talking about is the end of May to this date?
- A- M'mm.
- Q- Okay.

Okay, at paragraph 19, okay, you state that:

"Defendant Amrov was removed from the position of Chairperson by a resolution unanimously passed by the members present...", ta, ta, ta, ta.

Who told you that?

- A- Several people.
- Q- Tell me who.
 - A- I can't recall everyone who told me, but those include Soshima Vera-Cadet, Melanee Thomas,

1

1

1

1

1

1

1

	Erica Jabouin, Shanice Rose
59	Q- Okay. When was
	A and several others.
60	Q the first time that somebody told you that
	Defendant Amrov had been removed? When did you
	learn about that?
	A- It was sometime Friday evening.
61	Q- Friday evening?
	A- August third (3rd) evening.
62	Q- Okay, August third (3rd), you were told. By
	whom?
	A- I don't recall.
	Me ROSELINE OUELLETTE:
	He already answered the question.
	Me WILLIAM DE MERCHANT:
	No, he said he said several persons told him
	about it
	Me ROSELINE OUELLETTE:
	But he
	Me WILLIAM DE MERCHANT:
63	Q- But you don't remember who, on August third
	(3rd), told you that
	A- I received several phone calls, and I don't
	recall
64	Q- What

1

1

2

- A- ... from whom, and who was first.
- Q- Okay.

65

6 d

67

Okay, now if I recall correctly -- we'll get to that a bit later on -- you were rehired at that meeting?

- A- I -- without looking at the minutes, I don't recall exactly the wording that was used.
- Q- Okay. Okay, we'll get to that. It's in your Affidavit, the wording. Okay.

So, you don't -- you're saying to us today that you don't recall who was the first one to call you?

- A- That's correct.
- Q- At paragraph 22, you say:

"Mise en cause Malamo Savvas-Beaumont is an individual member of the D.S.U. and claimed to be a member of the Executive Committee."

What do you meanm she claimed to be a member of the D.S.U. Executive Committee? What do you mean by she "claimed to"? Isn't she a member of the Executive Committee?

A- I mean, it's my understanding that that's her position.

1

1

1

1

1

1

2

2

2

- 6 d Yes. Q -And it's also my understanding that that's not A the case. What is not the case? 6 d Q-That she is not a member of the Executive A -Committee. Oh, okay. You... 7 d 0 -That's my understanding. Okay, your understanding, she's not a member. 710-Now, you say in the same paragraph: "She was never elected by the said local association." What is that local association that you're talking to? The Dawson Student Union. **A** – Okay. So you're saying that she was never 72 0elected as a representative on the Executive Committee, right? To be a representative on the Quebec -- Canadian Α-Students, Quebec Federation of component, Executive Committee -- that's my understanding, correct.
 - A- To be the representative on the Executive

Okay, she was never elected by

association. Okay.

73

Q-

the

1

1

1

1

1

1

1

1

2

2

2

2

Committee.

- Q- Okay, c'est beau.
 - A- I don't dispute that she was elected at some point earlier for another position.
- 75 Q- Okay.

74

78

- A- The V.P. External, specifically.
- 76 Q- Okay. Okay, you don't dispute that she was elected as the V.P.?

Me ROSELINE OUELLETTE:

O I will object, it's not the right person to ask this question.

Me WILLIAM DE MERCHANT:

Okay, you object. Okay, perfect.

- Q- Okay, at paragraph 23...
- A- Yes.
- Q- Excuse me -- okay, at paragraph 41 you say:

 "As organizer, and being

 conversant with bylaws of the

 organization..."
 - I do not -- I'm not that good in English, so you have to help me on this one, what does "being conversant" mean?
- A- It means I'm pretty well aware of what they say, and, more specifically, I'm at least aware to where I should look in order...

1

1:

1

1

1

1

2

2

2

79 Q- Okay.

8 d

81

82

- A- ... to get advice.
- Q- Okay. At paragraph 23, you say that:

 "The decision of the Executive
 Committee purporting to ratify
 the membership of Mise en cause
 Beaumont in the said Executive
 Committee was annulled."

Now, where in the bylaws do we see that any person on the Executive Committee has to be ratified?

- A- Can I have permission to look into the -- I'd have to look at the bylaws.
- Q- Well, sure, that's what I'm asking you.
- A- I also wanted to note that these aren't the most up-to-date bylaws that were provided by your -- and are now part of the evidence, so...
- Q- Well, you gave them.
 - A- Well, I don't have access to the computer with the most up-to-date -- I do remember there was some -- if my recollection serves, there was some amendment around the specific wording, but I don't think it was of great consequence in this case.

1

1

1.

1

1

1

1

2

2

2

So, the witness is looking at the Exhibit P-1.

A- Oh, sorry.

83

84

85

剧

Q- No, it's okay.

Me WILLIAM DE MERCHANT:

No -- that's it, yes.

- A- Point 6.2 in Exhibit P-1.
- Q- Okay, thank you very much.

At paragraphs 24 and 25...

- A- Yes.
- Q- ... you speak of a person that was "duly elected." You don't use that wording at 26 and 27, you just say that they were "elected." Is there a difference, or it's just the way it was written? Why do you use, in some paragraphs, "duly elected," and in other paragraphs just "elected"?
 - A- I'm sorry, I still want to take -- clarify my answer to the last question, in that when you -- I don't recall your exact wording of your question, but when I referred you to 6.2, that refers specifically to local representatives, which are different than the members at large.

Local representatives are elected, as it

1

1

1

1

1

1

1

2

2

Š

says in 6.2, by their member local association, whereas members at large, as would be implied, are elected by the plenary, and then therefore represent all member locals, and have no specific responsibility to any individual local.

- 86 Q- Okay.
 - A- So, yes, to clear that.

And as far as the different wording, I don't think there's a significant reason for...

87 Q- Okay.

88

8 9

9 d

- A- ... why I didn't use the word "duly" later on.
- Q- There's no significant reason, okay.
- A- Not that I can think of, anyway.
- Q- So, you don't contest that Max Silverman was duly elected?
- A- It was my understanding at the time, which was sometime in November, I believe, maybe early December of two thousand and six (2006) -- and I apologize, I don't remember exactly -- that he was named by his local association to be the representative on the Provincial Executive -- on the Executive of the Canadian Federation of Students, Quebec component.
- Q- I'm asking was he duly elected?
- A- That's my understanding.

1

1:

1:

1:

1

1

1

1

2

2

2

91 Q- Okay.

At paragraph 33, you're talking about an assembly that was held, I think at -- when was that general...

- A- Sorry, the one referred to in paragraph...
- 92 Q- 33.
 - A- ... 32?
- 93 Q- Yes. 33 or -- and 33, yes.
 - A- When was that?
- 94 Q- When was 33 -- when did that meeting take place?
 - A- Oh, I'll just refer you back to 32.
- 95 Q- Yes.
 - A- It was -- it took place on April twenty-ninth (29th) and April thirtieth (30th).
- 96 Q- Okay.

- A- Or it was supposed to take place April thirtieth (30th), but we lost quorum on the twenty-ninth (29th), and we were able to regain the quorum, so the meeting actually never sat on the thirtieth (30th).
- Q- Were you present at that meeting?
- A- I was.

97

98

- Q- Yes? Do you know why the quorum was lost?
- A- We didn't have sufficient membership in attendance.

Τ

1

1.

1

1

1

1

1

Ţ

- 99 Q- Was there enough membership to start the meeting?
 - A- Without looking at the minutes, which -- if they're here, I can do that -- I don't recall exactly -- I remember we were in the room, I don't recall if the meeting was ever actually called to order.
- 1d0 Q- Okay.
 - A- There was -- I remember being in the room, but, again, I don't remember if we were -- I don't remember exactly what happened. Because there was a lot of discussion, I don't remember if at any time that meeting was called to order.
- 1d1 O- Okay. You don't recall?
 - A- If the minutes are here, I can look through those and...

But it's not in the...

A- Yes.

Me WILLIAM DE MERCHANT:

Okay.

Me ROSELINE OUELLETTE:

... it's not...

Me WILLIAM DE MERCHANT:

Non, mais c'est son affidavit...

1

1

ī

Yes, I know, but it's not in the case -- not in 'litige' -- to the facts in the 'litige.'

Me WILLIAM DE MERCHANT:

Non, c'est beau. C'est correct. Mais, il dit que le quorum a été perdu, je veux savoir pourquoi, mais il l'a dit.

 $1\sqrt{2}$ Q- Okay, at 38, you're saying that:

"Margaret Carlyle and Steven Rosenshine failed to return their keys to the CFS-Q office."

Did you try to get those keys?

- A- T did.
- 1d3 Q- Okay. What was your -- the response from Madame Carlyle and Mr. Rosenshine?
 - A- I had a hard time getting Steven on the phone a number of times. He also -- at that time, I -- at various times throughout this I have personally owned a car, but there was a period of time through which I did not, and I'm not very conversant with the metro system and how that works, and Steven lives quite far away, actually, and I wasn't able to get out to where he lives.
- 1 d4 Q- Okay.

1

1

2

A- Margaret was also out of the country and out of town for much of that time, and so I left messages, and when I could -- I spoke to Steven a couple of times, once in front of Mahdi Altalibi, and I believe Nina Amrov was there as well, and they both talked about intending on meeting up with these people, and dropping the keys off, and it was my understanding that that would happen.

Specifically with Margaret, who -- I even received confirmation from Nina Amrov and Mahdi Altalibi that -- they had contact with her and that she was to drop those keys off for them on a specific date that I don't know.

- 1d5 Q- So, you did speak with them? You did speak with Madame Carlyle and Mr. Rosenshein?
 - A- I left messages on their phone, yes, and I think twice (2)...
- 1d6 Q- Did you speak to them?

1

- A- Steven at least once (1), yes.
- 1d7 Q- Oh, at least -- and Madame Carlyle?
 - A- There was one (1) time, again, where I had understood she was going to be able to drop those keys off, and then she...
- 1d8 Q- I'm asking you if...

1(

1:

1:

1:

1

1

1

Ĺ

2

2

2

- A- Yes.
- 1d9 Q- ... you spoke with her. Yes, okay.
 - A- Yes.
- 110 Q- And you're telling me that she was supposed to drop the keys off?
 - A- Yes.
- 111 Q- Did they cooperate? Did they bring the keys?
 - A- As it turned out, they did not, as it says in
- 112 Q- Okay. Very good.

Okay, did Amrov and Altalibi give you instructions to get those keys?

- A- Yes.
- 113 Q- Yes. But because you did not know how the metro
 -- you never went to the place, that's what...
 - A- Well, I mean, on times when I called Steven he said -- and I -- or I found out that he was -- and there was one (1) time, for instance, that Mahdi was in front of me, and he was out in Côte St. Luc, and I said "Are you coming into town?" so -- and at that time there was no instruction given to me that I had to go above and beyond what was normally expected of someone.

So it was not because I didn't take the metro, I didn't get the keys, but it was that it

10

1:

1:

1

1

1!

1

1

1

2

2

2

2

2

was understood among even Mahdi Altalibi and Nina Amrov that they were going to be downtown and they would bring those keys at that point, and they never got delivered.

- 114 Q- Okay, they never -- so between the twentieth (20th) of June and the fourth (4th) of July, who had the keys to the office?
 - A- I'm just going to refer to my cell phone, there's a calendar on it -- that's all I'm doing, just to clarify the date.
- 115 Q- The client is looking on his cell phone -- the client -- Affiant.

Me ROSELINE OUELLETTE:

The witness.

A- Well, so -- the people who previously had the keys to the office, it was the former Executive members and myself.

Me WILLIAM DE MERCHANT:

116

- Q- Could you tell me who were the former Executive?
- A- Well, as listed here; Margaret Carlyle, and Steven Rosenshine, and myself. I think there might have been one (1) other key, and I don't recall if that was -- the National Office sometimes -- from time to time has keys to provincial offices, and I can't say for sure if

10

 \perp

1:

1:

14

1!

10

1

1

1.

2

2

2:

2

2

anyone from that office had a key.

- 117 Q- Okay. But you had a key?
 - A- I did, yes.
- 118 Q- Okay. Did you go to the office between the twentieth (20th) of June and the fourth (4th) of July?
 - A- Well, I was -- from what I recall, I met with Nina and Mahdi sometime on either the twentieth (20th) or the twenty-first (21st) in the office.

 I was also in the office on the twenty-second (22nd), for sure.

I can't say for sure whether or not I was in on the twenty-third (23rd) or twenty-fourth (24th) of June. And then -- yes, and then I had to leave for personal reasons during the week of the twenty-fifth (25th). I don't recall exactly what day that was, I'm sure that you might have a better recollection or a better -- you might have a date to offer me, I wouldn't dispute that necessarily. And then when I came back I was in the office on the third (3rd), throughout the day, as well.

119 Q- When you left on the twenty-fifth (25th) for personal reasons, did you give your key to Nina Amrov or Mahdi Altalibi?

1

1:

12

13

14

1!

10

. {

19

20

2:

22

2:

24

2!

- A- No. I received a call...
- 120 Q- No, my question was not if you -- did you leave some keys to them, that's my question.
 - A- No, I -- and my answer is no, I received an urgent message from my mother, and then left town quite early in the morning, and didn't think until after I was gone that I had the only key in Montreal.
- 121 Q- Did you receive any phone calls while you were out of Montreal concerning those keys?
 - A- I did.
- 122 Q- Did you have the key with you?
 - A- I did.
- 123 Q- Did you think about sending that key to them?
 - A- By mail?
- 124 Q- Yes. By bus, by...

Is that relevant...

Me WILLIAM DE MERCHANT:

Yes, it is.

- A- Well, you have my answer -- no. And nor was it requested.
- 125 Q- Okay.

Now, who -- how did the changing of lock happen on the fourth (4th) of July?

10

11

 \perp_2

13

14

15

16

1

18

19

20

2

22

24

2!

- A- Well, again, throughout that week there were several requests, and the Friday beforehand I think was the Friday that Margaret was supposed to have dropped off the keys...
- 126 Q- Don't look at your phone all the time, okay?

 Answer from your memory.
 - A- Okay, but I'm also just looking at dates...
- 127 Q- No, stop that, okay?
 - A- Well...
- 128 Q- Answer from memory, and if you cannot remember, just say so.
 - A- Okay, you don't need to be so angry with me, I think that's a little strange that you're getting upset when I'm just trying to answer your questions as honestly as possible.
- 129 Q- Okay.
 - A- But -- so, July fourth (4th) -- is that a Tuesday? I'm sorry, I can't tell, I don't have my phone to look at a calendar.
- 130 Q- No, my question to you was how did the lock change happen?
 - A- Okay, well, I had several requests throughout the previous week, I believe -- again, without being able to reference it, it makes it a little harder to remember -- that there was a -- that

1

1

1.

1

1

1

1

2

2

2

2

the Friday before July fourth (4th) was the date that Margaret Carlyle had informed myself, and Nina Amrov, and Mahdi Altalibi -- I'm not sure if she spoke directly to them, but I do know that they are both aware of that -- that she was supposed to drop the keys off for them.

So, that was kind of the last straw, that clearly the keys weren't going to be transferred, and that was being a frustration.

I had gotten back to Montreal on the fourth (4th), so upon my return, as per the instructions I had been given, I spoke to Mahdi, I believe, and then had the locks changed by the locksmith that's regularly used by our landlord and superintendent.

- 131 Q- Who contacted the locksmith?
 - A- I did, on request from Mahdi and Nina.
- 132 Q- From Mahdi and Nina?
 - A- And I believe that Roland Nassim had talked to me about it by then, as well.
- 133 Q- Okay, you're saying that Roland also spoke with you on this?
 - A- He -- I don't remember if he had given direction, I do recall that he had asked about

1

1

1

1

1

1

1

1

2

2

the keys.

- 134 Q- Now, was there any motion of the Executive Committee given to you concerning that change of that lock?
 - A- Not that I recall, no.
- 135 Q- Okay.
 - A- Oh, and I apologize, I had also been contacted both directly and also via a c.c.'d e-mail by Patrice Blais.
- 136 Q- Okay.
 - A- I don't recall all the parties that were c.c.'d on that e-mail.
- 137 Q- Okay. In paragraph 39...
 - A- Yes.
- 138 Q- ... you speak about an e-mail that was sent on the fourth (4th) of July. When did you first read that e-mail?

Me ROSELINE OUELLETTE:

You can go to the Exhibit P-4 to...

A- I don't recall when I first read it, I can only

-- I would imagine I read it on that day, but I

can't say for sure.

Me WILLIAM DE MERCHANT:

Okay.

139 Q- Were you in the office on that day?

1

1

1

1

1

1